



The City of Seattle

Pioneer Square Preservation Board

Mailing Address: PO Box 94649, Seattle WA 98124-4649

Street Address: 600 4th Avenue, 4th Floor

PSB 117/21

Staff REPORT

For ARC July 28, 2021

Board Members Please Note: The citations from the District Ordinance, Rules for the Pioneer Square Preservation District, and Secretary of the Interior's Standards listed below are for your consideration in addition to any other citations you find relevant in considering each application.

080520.3 **Grand Central, City Loan and Buttnick Buildings** Becca Pheasant-Reis, Scott Clark
(Squire Latimer, Gottstein, Brunswick-Balke-Collender)
216, 206 and 202 1st Ave S

Proposed alterations to the buildings including
 penthouse addition,
 replacement of windows and storefronts
 removing non original greenhouse structure
 adding new openings for new storefronts and doors
 removing ivy and repairing brick,
 adding lighting,
 seismic upgrades,
 new rooftop mechanical equipment,
Retains type of uses but changes the floorplan of uses,
Alterations to the areaways,
Replacement of the alley pavers

Staff report: The applicant last briefed the Board on August 5, 2020. Follow on items was requested.

Items not discussed in previous briefings:

Alternations to the north wall of the City Loan Building: Large expanses of the wall are proposed for removal. Fill is proposed for existing windows.

Window replacement: A window survey and inventory has been provided. The survey indicates that the windows are more contemporary replacement windows apart from stained-glass window transoms.

**Administered by The Historic Preservation Program
The Seattle Department of Neighborhoods**

"Printed on Recycled Paper"

Color pallet: Review of the new storefronts, windows and other materials. In the past the Board has maintained that building should retain their own color pallet as individual building would even when they are combined internally, but the color pallet should be coordinated. In the past there has been a desire to increase the use of color and variety on buildings.

Cornice on City Loan: Cornice has been removed. Proposal is to add a cornice back but not to recreate the former cornice design.

Lighting: renderings of the effect of proposed lighting in included.

Alley paver replacement. The alley is essentially original cobble. They proposal is to remove the cobble and replace it with brick and stone. The brick and stone proposed is the same as the new brick and stone in the "Nord alley" design with the following exceptions:

- No concrete edge is proposed next to the building,

- No reuse of the existing cobble. The alley design calls for reuse of existing historic brick/cobble next to the building in locations out of the ADA accessible pathway ie not in doorways,

- The center of the alley contains only the new stone rather than a 90% stone/10% brick pattern,

- The blending of the edge pattern is just one brick rather than feathered to the center.

- The edge pattern is just on the park side and not on the alley side.

The Board may also consider that the "Nord alley design" was replacing an alley that was primarily brick and this is replacing an alley that is primarily cobble. Does having the center only the stone material help to recall the existing material.

The Board should discuss if the some of the existing historic material should be retain and installed either next to the building out of pedestrian and ADA walkways or if there should be some other mitigation.

The Board should also express if the removal is being allowed in this location for the purpose of ADA accessibility and not that the material does not have historic value. A section drawing of construction will be needed for final approval.

Follow up items:

The design has been changed so that the rooftop coverage is 50% as allowed in the code 23.66.140 for use as an office

Code also requires that the penthouse be set back 15 feet. However, on the Buttnick building the setback does not comply with 15-foot set back requirement. The code does allow for the Board to modify the setbacks for rooftop features if the feature is minimally visible from 300 feet. The Board would first have to determine if the penthouse is minimally visible from 300 feet. The applicant said there was a structural reason for the location of the penthouse wall and the Board asked for that to be demonstrated in a drawing.

Areaways:

The areaway for the Buttnick was reinforced with careful guidance from the Board to maintain the historical features it is rated “substantially intact/minor alterations.” City Loan building areaway is rated “new or significantly altered,” and the Grand Central is rated “substantially altered.” There is also an existing vault on the Main Street in the areaway.

Fire escapes:

The proposal does not include:

- Plants for the rooftop planter,
- Signage,
- Solar panels,
- Awning or canopies

Code Citations:

SMC 23.66.030 Certificates of Approval required

SMC 23.66.140 – Height

C. Rooftop features and additions to structures

3. The setbacks required for rooftop features may be modified by the Department of Neighborhoods Director, after a sight line review by the Preservation Board to ensure that the features are minimally visible from public streets and parks within 300 feet of the structure.

4. Height limits for rooftop features

b. For existing structures, open railings, planters, clerestories, skylights, play equipment, parapets, and firewalls may extend up to 4 feet above the roof of the structure or the maximum height limit, whichever is less. For new structures, such features may extend up to 4 feet above the maximum height limit. No rooftop coverage limits apply to such features regardless of whether the structure is existing or new.

d. The following rooftop features may extend up to 8 feet above the roof or maximum height limit, whichever is less, if they are set back a minimum of 15 feet from the street and 3 feet from an alley. They may extend up to 15 feet above the roof if set back a minimum of 30 feet from the street. A setback may not be required at common wall lines subject to review by the Preservation Board and approval by the Department of Neighborhoods Director. The combined coverage of the following listed rooftop features shall not exceed 15 percent of the roof area:

- 2) stair and elevator penthouses;
- 3) mechanical equipment;

4) minor communication utilities and accessory communication devices, except that height is regulated according to the provisions of [Section 23.57.014](#).

Additional combined coverage of these rooftop features, not to exceed 25 percent of the roof area, may be permitted subject to review by the Preservation Board and approval by the Department of Neighborhoods Director.

f. Residential and office penthouses

2) Office penthouses are permitted only if the footprint of the existing structure is greater than 10,000 square feet and the structure is at least 60 feet in height. When permitted, office penthouses shall be set back a minimum of 15 feet from all property lines and may cover a maximum of 50 percent of the total roof surface. Office penthouses may extend up to 12 feet above the roof of the structure and shall be functionally integrated into the existing structure.

3) The combined height of the structure and a residential penthouse or office penthouse, if permitted, shall not exceed the maximum height limit for that area of the District in which the structure is located.

g. Screening of rooftop features. Measures may be taken to screen rooftop features from public view subject to review by the Preservation Board and approval by the Department of Neighborhoods Director. The amount of rooftop area enclosed by rooftop screening may exceed the maximum percentage of the combined coverage of rooftop features listed in subsection 23.66.140.C.4.d. In no circumstances shall the height of rooftop screening exceed 15 feet above the maximum height limit or height of an addition permitted according to subsection 23.66.140.C.4.i or otherwise, whichever is higher.

23.66.180 - Exterior building design.

To complement and enhance the historic character of the District and to retain the quality and continuity of existing buildings, the following requirements shall apply to exterior building design:

A. Materials. Unless an alternative material is approved by the Department of Neighborhoods Director following Board review and recommendation, exterior building facades shall be brick, concrete tinted a subdued or earthen color, sandstone or similar stone facing material commonly used in the District. Aluminum, painted metal, wood and other materials may be used for signs, window and door sashes and trim, and for similar purposes when approved by the Department of Neighborhoods Director as compatible with adjacent or original uses, following Board review and recommendation.

B. Scale. Exterior building facades shall be of a scale compatible with surrounding structures. Window proportions, floor height, cornice line,

street elevations and other elements of the building facades shall relate to the scale of the buildings in the immediate area.

Pioneer Square Preservation District Rules

III. GENERAL GUIDELINES FOR REHABILITATION AND NEW CONSTRUCTION

In addition to the Pioneer Square Preservation District Ordinance and Rules, The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation with Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, and the complete series of Historic Buildings Preservation Briefs developed by the National Park Service shall serve as guidelines for proposed exterior alterations and treatments, rehabilitation projects, and new construction. (7/99)

Rehabilitation is defined as the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features which convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values. (7/99) In considering rehabilitation projects, what is critical is the stabilization of significant historical detailing, respect for the original architectural style, and compatibility of scale and materials.

The following architectural elements are typical throughout the District and will be used by the Board in the evaluation of requests for design approval:

- A. Site. The property line is the line of the building mass. Street facades are uniformly located at the front property lines, thus there is a strong street edge definition. Building cornices, bay windows and ornament project beyond the main wall surface of some facades.
- B. Design. Building design is generally typified by horizontal divisions which create distinctive base and cap levels. Facades may also be divided vertically by pilasters or wide piers which form repetitive window bays. Street facades are also distinguished by heavy terminal cornices and parapets, ornamental storefronts and entrance bays and repetitive window sizes and placement.
- C. Building materials. The most common facing materials are brick masonry and cut or rusticated sandstone, with limited use of terra cotta and tile. Wooden window sash, ornamental sheet metal, carved stone and wooden or cast iron storefronts are also typically used throughout the District. Synthetic stucco siding materials are generally not permitted. (7/99)
- D. Color. Building facades are primarily composed of varied tones of red brick masonry or gray sandstone. Unfinished brick, stone, or concrete masonry unit surfaces may not be painted. Painted color is typically applied to wooden window sash, sheet metal ornament and wooden or cast iron storefronts. Paint colors shall be appropriate to ensure compatibility within the District. (7/99)
- E. Building Base. Buildings are allowed a base of approximately 18-24 inches. Base materials should be concrete, sandstone, or granite, and may be poured,

cut to fit or unit-paved. The color relationship between the sidewalk and building must be considered. Brick or tile materials should not be used except when existing walks are of the same material.

X. FIRE ESCAPES

Fire escapes are important character-defining features of numerous buildings in the District. They are particularly important in contributing to the special character of the District's alleyscapes. Proposals to remove or alter fire escapes shall be reviewed on a case by case basis with special consideration given to safety issues. However, as a general rule, fire escapes shall be retained. (7/99)

XVII. SIDEWALK TREATMENT

A. Standards

Sidewalk paving and improvements shall be completed with one pound lamp-black per cubic yard of concrete, scored at two-foot intervals. This material shall be used for all projects of 1/4 block or greater size. On small projects, if it is feasible, sidewalk material may be selected as for all projects of 1/4 block or greater size. On small projects, if it is feasible, sidewalk material may be selected to match adjacent sidewalks in color, pattern and texture.

B. Sidewalk Prism Lights

The glass sidewalk prism lights are one of the unique elements in the District, and their retention is required. The Board maintains the right to require applicants for sidewalk repair to repair sidewalk prism light panels and individual prism lights that have deteriorated into a state of disrepair. (7/99)

XVIII. AREAWAYS

Areaways are usable areas constructed under the sidewalk between the building foundation and street wall. Areaways were created after the Great Seattle Fire of 1889 when the District was rebuilt and the street elevations were raised. Building standards adopted shortly after the fire required fireproof sidewalk construction to replace the pre-fire wooden sidewalks. Areaways are part of the City's right-of-way area, however, the space is often available for use by the adjacent building owner. (7/03)

The most significant qualities of an areaway are its volume of space, which provides a record of its history, and the architectural features that render its form, character, and spatial quality. These features include use of unit materials (brick or stone), bays articulated by arches and/or columns, ceiling vaults, and other special features including tilework or skylights (sidewalk

prism lenses). The historic characteristics of areaways shall be preserved.
(7/03)

In 2001, the Seattle Department of Transportation completed a survey of approximately 100 areaways in the District. Each areaway was rated in terms of its structural condition and presence of original historic characteristics. A range of structural repairs options were proposed based on the structural and historical ratings. The 2001 Seattle Department of Transportation Areaway Survey shall serve as a guide for the Board's decision making on future alterations or repairs to areaways in the District.
(7/03)

XIX. ALLEYS

- A. Alley Paving. Alleys are to be paved with unit paving materials. Three types are acceptable in the District: remolded paving bricks, cobbles, and interlocking brick-tone pavers. Alleys should be repaired or re-paved in the original unit material when these materials remain available. All other alleys should be paved with remolded brick. The center drainage swale, peculiar to alleys, should be preserved as part of alley re-paving. Unit paved alleys should not be patched with any material other than approved unit paving.

Secretary of Interior's Standards

1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces and spatial relationships.
2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.
4. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.

5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.
7. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.
9. New additions, exterior alterations or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

[Preservation Brief 3: Improving Energy Efficiency in Historic Buildings](#)

[Preservation Brief 14: New Exterior Additions to Historic Buildings Concerns](#)

[Preservation Brief 9: Repair of wooden windows](#)

[Preservation Brief 41 Seismic improvements](#)

[Interpreting the Standards 21: Adding new openings on secondary elevations](#)

[Pioneer Square Alley Design Manual](#)

Issued: July 22, 2021

Genna Nashem
Pioneer Square Preservation Board Coordinator